

Large Variations in Southern Hemisphere Biomass Burning During the Last 650 Years

Z. Wang,¹ J. Chappellaz,² K. Park,¹ J. E. Mak^{1*}

¹Institute for Terrestrial and Planetary Atmospheres/School of Marine and Atmospheric Sciences, Stony Brook University, NY 11794-5000, USA. ²Laboratoire de Glaciologie et Géophysique de l'Environnement (LGGE, CNRS and University of Grenoble), 38402 St Martin d'Hères Cedex, France.

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: jemak@notes.cc.sunysb.edu

We present a 650-year Antarctic ice core record of concentration and isotopic ratios ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) of atmospheric carbon monoxide. Concentrations decreased by ~25% (14 ppbv) from mid-1300s to the 1600s, then recovered completely by the late 1800s. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ decreased by about 2‰ and 4‰ respectively from mid-1300s to the 1600s, then increase by about 2.5‰ and 4‰ by the late 1800s. These observations and isotope mass balance model results imply that large variations in the degree of biomass burning in the Southern Hemisphere occurred during the last 650 years, with a decrease by about 50% in the 1600s, an increase of about 100% by the late 1800s, and another decrease by about 70% from the late 1800s to present day.

Carbon monoxide (CO) plays a key role in the chemistry of the troposphere, largely determining the oxidation potential of the atmosphere through its interaction with hydroxyl radical (OH). CO also interacts with atmospheric methane, a gas whose preindustrial variability is the topic of continuing debate (1–2). Little is known about the variability of CO prior to the industrial age (3) or about the anthropogenic impact on its budget, although both affect atmospheric CH_4 and O_3 budgets and related climate/chemistry interactions.

The main sources of atmospheric CO include atmospheric oxidation of methane and non-methane hydrocarbons (NMHC), biomass burning, and fossil fuel combustion (4). These sources account for about 90% of today's global CO budget (4). Stable isotopic ratios ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) in atmospheric CO help to resolve the relative contributions of these sources and thus to better estimate the global CO budget (5). To date, no isotopic ratios from CO in ice have been reported and few CO mixing ratio measurements have been reported (1, 3, 6). Using a recently developed analytical technique (7), we present measurements of CO concentration ([CO]), $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ from a South Pole ice core (89°57'S 17°36'W 2800 m a.s.l.) and from the D47 ice core (67°23'S 154°03'E 1550 m a.s.l.) in Antarctica (Fig. 1).

The combined changes in [CO], $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ during the past 650 years should reflect variations in both total CO flux and a shift in relative source strengths over time. [CO] shows a decreasing trend from 53 ± 5 parts per billion by volume (ppbv) in the mid-1300s to a minimum of 38 ± 5 ppbv in the 1600s. CO mixing ratio then increases to a relatively constant value of 55 ± 5 ppbv in the late 1800s. Good agreement is observed between our [CO] data and previous measurements on Antarctic ice samples (3, 6). Trends in both $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ look similar to the [CO] record up to the late 1800s. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (V-PDB) and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ (V-SMOW) decreased from $-28.0 \pm 0.3\text{‰}$ and $0.6 \pm 0.7\text{‰}$ in the mid-1300s to $-30.2 \pm 0.3\text{‰}$ and $-3.4 \pm 0.7\text{‰}$ in the 1600s, then increased to $-27.4 \pm 0.3\text{‰}$ and $0.8 \pm 0.7\text{‰}$ by the late 1800s. Minimum values of [CO], $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ roughly coincide with the Little Ice Age (LIA, ca. 1500–1800) as defined in the Northern Hemisphere.

Observations from Berkner Island (79°32.90' S 45°40.7' W 890 m a.s.l.) firn and present day samples are also shown in Fig. 1. The slight decrease of [CO] from the late 1800s to present day is thus accompanied by large shifts in both $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, which is a result of variations in relative source strengths during the past century. In particular, methane-derived CO, which is dependent upon methane concentration and depleted in both $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, increased dramatically, by 13 ppbv, during this time (Fig. 2). Since there was little change in overall [CO] during this time, contributions from other CO sources must have decreased by a similar amount. Data from Berkner Island firn air show a relatively constant [CO] and a decrease in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ since 1970 (8), reflecting the increase in atmospheric methane (9).

The contribution from fossil fuel combustion is negligible prior to the 1900s based on historic CO_2 emissions from fossil fuel combustion (10). In addition, simulations from the Model for Ozone and Related chemical Tracers (MOZART-4) (see Supporting Online Material, SOM) shows the fossil fuel combustion contribution to today's CO budget in Antarctica is only 2–3 ppbv. Thus the main sources of CO able to explain our signals are biomass burning and NMHC oxidation.

We can use isotopic compositions to help distinguish combustion-derived CO (e.g., biomass burning) from non-

combustion derived CO (e.g., hydrocarbon oxidation). $C^{18}O$ is a useful tracer for this because of large differences in the oxygen isotopic composition between combustion and noncombustion sources of CO (11). The $\delta^{18}O$ signature from combustion sources is significantly enriched compared to the $\delta^{18}O$ signature from hydrocarbon oxidation processes (11–12). $\delta^{18}O$ value for biomass burning derived CO is generally between 15‰ and 22‰, depending on specific combustion conditions (12–14).

We use an isotope mass balance model to estimate the ratio of combustion to noncombustion sources over the time period of interest (see SOM). Steady state atmospheric conditions are assumed based on the relatively short lifetime of CO (weeks to months) compared to the integrated sampling time for a typical ice core sample (~ 10 years for the D47 ice core and ~ 30 years for the South Pole ice core). Resulting source emission estimates are shown in Fig. 2. Also shown are source emission estimates over the last three decades and those in present day. CO from NMHC oxidation did not change significantly, whereas CO from biomass burning showed a large “saddle” trend, with maxima in both the mid-1300s and the late 1800s and a minimum in the 1600s. The observed trend in [CO], $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{18}O$ was therefore mostly driven by variations in biomass burning, and compared to present day, biomass burning was almost the same in the late 1800s as that in the mid-1300s. This is consistent with the correlation observed between $\delta^{18}O$ and CO concentration (Fig. S1). The y-intercept of 9‰, corrected for the inverse mass dependent kinetic isotope effect (KIE) for CO+OH (15) during atmospheric transport, leads to a mean oxygen isotopic signature of the source of 15–18‰, which indicates a predominant combustion source.

We have assumed that the observations were driven by variations in CO source strengths. It is possible, however, that the removal rate of CO by OH could have changed. However, if that were the case, then a slight enrichment in $\delta^{13}C$ should be observed, due to the KIE (15). This is contrary to the observations. The second largest loss mechanism known for CO (but only accounting for 10%) is uptake by soils, which is largely dependent upon soil surface area and mean temperature (16), both of which have not changed much in the Southern Hemisphere during the past several hundred years (17).

Satellite data combined with biogeochemical models to interpret the interannual variability of global biomass burning emissions show that from 1997 to 2004, lower temperature and higher precipitation correlated with reduced biomass burning emission (18). On longer time scales, biomass burning was shown to increase with the rapid Dansgaard/Oeschger warmings of the last glacial, probably due to increased vegetation productivity and fuel availability for burning (19).

Our calculated biomass burning trend (Fig. 2) is generally consistent with the tropical charcoal index (Fig. 3) (20). The charcoal index, a proxy for biomass burning, suggests a decline from ~0 to ~1750 followed by a sharp increase between 1750 and 1870 and a substantial decrease during the last century (20). Because of the fast deposition of charcoal particles, the charcoal index reflects a more regional component of biomass burning compared to CO; however the general trends for the two records are consistent within the range of calculated uncertainty, with perhaps the exception of the period of 1600–1700. The initial decline in biomass burning occurred in concert with a global cooling trend, reflecting the impact of climate change (20). The cooling was more muted on average in the Southern Hemisphere (21). But in a region like southern South America, warm episodes are recorded before 1350 and in the early 19th century (22), coinciding with the stronger biomass burning emissions of CO deduced from our record. Since the 1700s, the increase of biomass burning has likely been influenced by both natural and anthropogenic forcings. This trend is also consistent with Berkner Island firn air data from ~1970 to present day. Such a reduction may result from a shift toward intensive grazing and fire management (23), which could lead to a change in landscape makeup and subsequently less biomass availability in some regions (24).

Biomass burning changes during the last two millennia have also been evaluated using [CH₄] and $\delta^{13}CH_4$ records from the Law Dome ice core (1). These investigators conclude that the pyrogenic emissions of CH₄ decreased by ~40% on the global scale in 1700 relative to the emissions from 0 to 1000, a figure that is consistent with our calculated ~50% drop of biomass burning emissions of CO during the 1600s in the Southern Hemisphere. Furthermore, recent research based on the stable isotopic ratios of methane in WAIS Divide ice core (79°27.7'S 112°7.51'W; 1759 m a.s.l.) also indicates the median biomass burning source strength decreased by 38±1% from period of 990–1460 to 1689–1730 (25).

Long term variations in atmospheric circulation could have partly modulated the long-range transport of biomass burning CO from the tropics to the high-latitude Southern Hemisphere (26), thus contributing in part to the calculated CO variability. For instance, a strengthened polar vortex could inhibit latitudinal exchanges and extratropical CO intrusion into the Antarctic atmosphere. However, the last period of intensification of southern circumpolar westerlies and accompanying relatively cooler conditions over East Antarctica (27) and West Antarctica occurred ~1200–1000 years ago (28), well prior to the period of this study. While it cannot be entirely ruled out, indications are that circumpolar circulation did not change significantly during this period and did not have a large impact on CO large-scale transport.

Another possible process which has a major effect on the meridional transport of CO is the movement of Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) (29). Paleoclimatic evidence from continental Asia (30), Africa (31), the Americas (32) and Pacific ocean (33) suggests that a southward shift of ITCZ occurred during the past millennium, reaching its southernmost position some time during the LIA (33). As ITCZ shifts southward, less CO produced from biomass burning will be transported to Southern Hemisphere. This would have reduced the contribution of Southern Hemisphere biomass burning to [CO] observed in Antarctica during the LIA. A southward shift of the ITCZ position would also shift rainfall patterns southward as well, as precipitation follows the ITCZ (34). The southward shift of precipitation could contribute to decrease as well biomass burning during the LIA since biomass burning requires dry conditions.

Previous modeling studies suggest that preindustrial biomass burning was much lower than today, with a reduction of up to 90% (35–37). This is the common assumption in climate model simulations. However, our results show that present day CO from Southern Hemisphere biomass burning is lower than at any other time during the last 650 years. This is particularly relevant since assumptions on preindustrial [CO] are an important component for correctly estimating the radiative forcing of tropospheric ozone in preindustrial times (38). [CO] changes due to biomass burning also suggest that there were decadal and centennial scale variations in average concentrations of black carbon, another major atmospheric constituent produced with burning, leading to the unanswered question of its potential role in long term climate variability.

References and Notes

1. D. F. Ferretti *et al.*, Unexpected changes to the global methane budget over the past 2000 years. *Science* **309**, 1714 (2005).
2. J. R. Petit *et al.*, Climate and atmospheric history of the past 420,000 years from the Vostok ice core, Antarctica. *Nature* **399**, 429 (1999).
3. D. Haan, P. Martinerie, D. Raynaud, Ice core data of atmospheric carbon monoxide over Antarctica and Greenland during the last 200 years. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **23**, 2235 (1996).
4. W. Seiler, Cycle of atmospheric CO. *Tellus* **26**, 116 (1974).
5. P. Bergamaschi, R. Hein, C. A. M. Brenninkmeijer, P. J. Crutzen, Inverse modeling of the global CO cycle 2. Inversion of $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ and $^{18}\text{O}/^{16}\text{O}$ isotope ratios. *J. Geophys. Res.* **105**, 1929 (2000).
6. D. Haan, D. Raynaud, Ice core record of CO variations during the last two millennia: atmospheric implications and chemical interactions within the Greenland ice. *Tellus* **50**, 253 (1998).
7. Z. Wang, J. E. Mak, A new CF-IRMS system for quantifying stable isotopes of carbon monoxide from ice cores and small air samples. *Atmos. Meas. Tech.* **3**, 1307 (2010).
8. S. S. Assonov *et al.*, Evidence for a CO increase in the SH during the 20th century based on firn air samples from Berkner Island, Antarctica. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* **7**, 295 (2007).
9. C. M. Macfarling Meure *et al.*, Law Dome CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O ice core records extended to 2000 years BP. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **33**, (2006).
10. G. Marland, T. A. Boden, R. J. Andres, Global, Regional, and National Fossil-Fuel CO₂ Emissions. In Trends: A compendium of data on Global Change. *Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tenn., U.S.A.*
11. C. A. M. Brenninkmeijer, T. Rockmann, Principal factors determining the $^{18}\text{O}/^{16}\text{O}$ ratio of atmospheric CO as derived from observations in the southern hemispheric troposphere and lowermost stratosphere. *J. Geophys. Res.* **102**, 25477 (1997).
12. C. A. M. Brenninkmeijer, Measurement of the abundance of ^{14}C in the atmosphere and the $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ and $^{18}\text{O}/^{16}\text{O}$ ratio of atmospheric CO with applications in New Zealand and Antarctica. *J. Geophys. Res.* **98**, 10595 (1993).
13. S. Kato, H. Akimoto, T. Rockmann, M. Braunlich, C. A. M. Brenninkmeijer, Stable isotopic compositions of carbon monoxide from biomass burning experiments. *Atmos. Environ.* **33**, 4357 (1999).
14. C. M. Stevens, A. F. Wagner, The Role of Isotope Fractionation Effects in Atmospheric Chemistry. *Z. Naturforsch. A.* **44**, 376 (1989).
15. C. M. Stevens *et al.*, The kinetic isotope effect for carbon and oxygen in the reaction CO + OH. *Int. J. Chem. Kinet.* **12**, 935 (1980).
16. R. E. Inman, Ingersol, Rb, E. A. Levy, Soil - Natural sink for carbon monoxide. *Science* **172**, 1229 (1971).
17. M. E. Mann, P. D. Jones, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **30**, (2003).
18. G. R. van der Werf *et al.*, Interannual variability in global biomass burning emissions from 1997 to 2004. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* **6**, 3423 (2006).
19. A.-L. Daniau, S. P. Harrison, P. J. Bartlein, Fire regimes during the Last Glacial. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **29**, 2918 (2010).
20. J. R. Marlon *et al.*, Climate and human influences on global biomass burning over the past two millennia. *Nature Geoscience* **1**, 697 (2008).
21. M. E. Mann *et al.*, Global Signatures and Dynamical Origins of the Little Ice Age and Medieval Climate Anomaly. *Science* **326**, 1256 (2009).
22. R. Neukom *et al.*, Multiproxy summer and winter surface air temperature field reconstructions for southern South America covering the past centuries. *Clim. Dyn.* (2010), doi: 10.1007/s00382-010-0793-3.

23. K. K. Goldewijk, Estimating global land use change over the past 300 years: The HYDE Database. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* **15**, 417 (2001).
24. S. J. Pyne, *World Fire: The Culture of Fire on Earth* (Univ. of Washington Press, Seattle, 1995).
25. J. A. Mischler *et al.*, Carbon and hydrogen isotopic composition of methane over the last 1000 years. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* **23**, (2009), doi: Gb4024 10.1029/2009gb003460.
26. D. P. Edwards *et al.*, Satellite-observed pollution from Southern Hemisphere biomass burning. *J. Geophys. Res.* **111**, (2006).
27. V. Masson *et al.*, Holocene climate variability in Antarctica based on 11 ice-core isotopic records. *Quat. Res.* **54**, 348 (2000).
28. P. A. Mayewski *et al.*, State of the Antarctic and Southern Ocean climate system. *Rev. Geophys.* **47**, (2009).
29. W. Seiler, H. Giehl, E. G. Brunke, E. Halliday, The seasonality of CO abundance in the Southern Hemisphere. *Tellus* **36**, 219 (1984).
30. D. M. Anderson, J. T. Overpeck, A. K. Gupta, Increase in the Asian southwest monsoon during the past four centuries. *Science* **297**, 596 (2002).
31. D. Verschuren, K. R. Laird, B. F. Cumming, Rainfall and drought in equatorial east Africa during the past 1,100 years. *Nature* **403**, 410 (2000).
32. Haug, G. H., K. A. Hughen, D. M. Sigman, L. C. Peterson, U. Rohl, Southward migration of the intertropical convergence zone through the Holocene. *Science* **293**, 1304 (2001).
33. J. P. Sachs *et al.*, Southward movement of the Pacific intertropical convergence zone AD 1400-1850. *Nature Geoscience* **2**, 519 (2009).
34. J. C. Stager, C. Cocquyt, R. Bonnefille, C. Weyhenmeyer, N. Bowerman, A late Holocene paleoclimatic history of Lake Tanganyika, East Africa. *Quat. Res.* **72**, 47 (2009).
35. P. J. Crutzen, P. H. Zimmermann, The changing photochemistry of the troposphere. *Tellus* **43**, 136 (1991).
36. A. Ito, J. E. Penner, Historical emissions of carbonaceous aerosols from biomass and fossil fuel burning for the period 1870-2000. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* **19**, (2005).
37. F. Mouillot, A. Narasimha, Y. Balkanski, J. F. Lamarque, C. B. Field, Global carbon emissions from biomass burning in the 20th century. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **33**, (2006).
38. M. Gauss *et al.*, Radiative forcing since preindustrial times due to ozone change in the troposphere and the lower stratosphere. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* **6**, 575 (2006).
39. We thank C. A. M. Brenninkmeijer for useful help and discussions. South Pole ice core samples were provided by National Ice Core Laboratory (NICL) and drilled by Dr. Jihong Cole-Dai and colleagues. We greatly thank Mark

Twickler for ice allocation and thank Brian Bencivengo, Eric Cravens, and Geoffrey Hargreaves for cutting and shipping ice. We thank the drillers (LGGE) and logistics (French polar institute) who made D47 drilling possible. We also thank Ed Brook and James Edward Lee from Oregon State University for providing bubble free ice and Maurine Montagnat, LGGE, CNRS for providing monocrystalline and polycrystalline bubble free ice. We also thank L. Emmons for useful help on MOZART-4 simulation and NCAR for providing supercomputing environment for MOZART-4 simulation. Z. Wang strongly thanks P. Martinerie for logistical support in Grenoble. We are grateful to D. Black, V. Masson-Delmotte, and D. Knopf for their useful comments. This work was supported by the National Science Foundation grant OCE0731406, the European Science Foundation (ESF) EURO-CORES Programme EuroCLIMATE (contract ERAS-CT-2003-980409 of the European Commission, DG Research, FP6) and Institut National des Sciences de l'Univers (INSU) project ISOTRACE-FP21, and the French ANR NEEM (ANR-O7-VULN-09-001). We thank Andy Matthews from Mt. Sinai High School for providing a walkin freezer to prepare some ice core samples.

Supporting Online Material

www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/science.1197257/DC1

Materials and Methods

Figs S1 to S4

Tables S1 to S3

References

1 September 2010; accepted 1 November 2010

Published Online 2 December 2010;

10.1126/science.1197257

Fig. 1. The 650-year records of [CO], $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ from two ice cores: D47 ice core (diamonds) and South Pole ice core (squares). (A) [CO]; (B) $\delta^{13}\text{C}$; (C) $\delta^{18}\text{O}$. Error bars represent analytical uncertainties. The shaded area shows the timing of the LIA. Also shown are observations of annually averaged [CO], $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ of atmospheric CO (crosses) at Scott Base in 1991 (12). Berkner Island firn air data (stars) (δ) roughly covering the last three decades of the 20th century show a 5 ppbv increase of [CO], 2.5‰ decrease of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, and a slight increase in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ since the late 1960s.

Fig. 2. Modeled CO source partitioning based on observations and isotope mass balance model: (A) [CO] from methane oxidation; (B) [CO] from NMHC oxidation, and (C) [CO] from biomass burning. Different scenarios have been tested in the model to show the sensitivity of minor sources

(see SOM). Thick lines in (B) and (C) represent the mean values of different scenarios and shaded areas represent different scenario run results and uncertainties. [CH₄] data are from Law Dome record (9). [CO] derived from the three major sources since the late 1960s is calculated based on Berkner Island firm air data (8) and isotope mass balance model (orange circles). CO source partitioning at present day is calculated based on MOZART-4 simulation and CO measurements (annually average in 1997-2004) at Scott Base (red squares).

Fig. 3. Correlation between the derived CO from biomass burning (green line) and the sedimentary charcoal record compilation in the tropics (30°N-20°S) (red line) (20). Red shaded area represents charcoal index measurement uncertainties. Also shown is the MOZART-4 simulated CO from biomass burning emission at Scott Base for the modern atmosphere.





